NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

STATE OF NEW YORK SUPREME COURT: COUNTY OF ERIE

AB 504 DOE,	Index No
	······································

Plaintiff, SUMMONS

v.

CHEEKTOWAGA-MARYVALE UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT

Defendant(s).

TO THE ABOVE NAMED DEFENDANT(S):

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to answer the Complaint, a copy of which is hereby served upon you, and to serve a copy of your Answer to the Complaint upon the undersigned attorneys listed below within twenty (20) days after the service of this Summons, exclusive of the day of service (or within thirty (30) days after the service is complete if this Summons is not personally delivered to you within the State of New York); and in the case of your failure to appear or answer, judgment by default will be taken against you for the relief demanded herein.

Dated: September 27, 2019

Leah Costanzo, Esq.
STEVE BOYD, PC
40 North Forest Road

Williamsville, NY 14221 Telephone: (716) 400-0000 lcostanzo@steveboyd.com

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

Jeffrey R. Anderson
J. Michael Reck
JEFF ANDERSON & ASSOCIATES, P.A.
52 Duane Street, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10007
Telephone: (646) 759-2551
jeff@andersonadvocates.com
mreck@andersonadvocates.com

Counsel for Plaintiff

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

STATE OF NEW YORK SUPREME COURT: COUNTY OF ERIE

AB 504 DOE,		Index No.
Plaintiff,		COMPLAINT
v.		
CHEEKTOWAGA-MARYVALE FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT	UNION	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL ¹
Defendant(s).		

Plaintiff, by and through Plaintiff's attorneys, states and alleges as follows:

PSEUDONYM

1. Plaintiff is authorized to file the instant action under a pseudonym and defendants are barred from disclosing Petitioner's true identity to the general public pursuant to an Amended Order of the Honorable Deborah A. Chimes. J.S.C. dated August 13, 2018 which is attached hereto.

PARTIES

- 2. At all times material to this Complaint, Plaintiff resided in the State of New York.
- 3. Whenever reference is made to any Defendant entity, such reference includes that entity, affiliates, predecessors, and successors. In addition, whenever reference is made to any act, deed, or transaction of any entity, the allegation means that the entity engaged in the act, deed, or transaction by or through its officers, directors, agents, employees, or representatives while they were actively engaged in the management, direction, control, or transaction of the entity's business or affairs.

¹ Pursuant to §4 of the New York Child Victims Act, Plaintiff is entitled to a trial preference.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

4. At all times material, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District was and continues to be a public school district located in the County of Erie and State of New York.

- 5. At all times material, Maryvale East Elementary School was a public school owned, controlled, supervised, operated and managed by Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District.
- 6. At all times material, Stanley Bratt was an employee of Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District.

JURISDICTION

- 7. This Court has jurisdiction pursuant to C.P.L.R. § 301 as Defendant is a quasi-municipal corporation created and organized by state legislatures and charged with the administration of public schools in the State of New York and because the unlawful conduct complained of herein occurred in New York.
- 8. Venue is proper pursuant to C.P.L.R. § 504 in that Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District is situated in Erie County.
- 9. This complaint is brought under the Child Victims Act and, as such, the filing of a Notice of Claim is not required.

FACTS

- 10. At all times material, Bratt was employed by Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District and remained under the direct supervision, employ, and control of Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District.
- 11. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District placed Bratt in positions where he had access to and worked with children as an integral part of his work.

ERIE COUNTY CLERK 09/27/2019 09:53

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

Specifically, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District placed and retained

Bratt at Maryvale East Elementary School as a Music Teacher.

12. At all times material, Plaintiff was a student at Maryvale East Elementary School.

Plaintiff, as a minor and vulnerable child, was dependent on Defendant 13.

Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District and Bratt. Defendant Cheektowaga-

Maryvale Union Free School District had custody of Plaintiff and was entrusted with the safety

of Plaintiff and, therefore, had responsibility and authority over Plaintiff.

14. From approximately 1973 to 1977, when Plaintiff was approximately eleven to

fifteen years old, Bratt engaged in unpermitted sexual contact with Plaintiff.

15. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District knew or should

have known that Bratt was a danger to children before Bratt sexually assaulted Plaintiff.

16. Prior to the sexual abuse of Plaintiff, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union

Free School District learned or should have learned that Bratt was not fit to work with children.

Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District, by and through its agents,

servants and/or employees, became aware, or should have become aware of Bratt's propensity to

commit sexual abuse and of the risk to Plaintiff's safety. At the very least, Defendant

Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District knew or should have known that it did not

have sufficient information about whether or not its employees, more specifically Bratt, were fit

to work with children.

17. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District knew or should

have known that there was a risk of the sexual abuse of children attending Maryvale East

Elementary School. At the very least, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School

District knew or should have known that they did not have sufficient information about whether

ERIE COUNTY CLERK 09/27/2019 09:53

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

or not there was a risk of child sex abuse for children attending Maryvale East Elementary

School.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

18. Instead, Defendant negligently deemed that Bratt was fit to work with children

and/or that any previous misconduct was fixed or cured and/or that Bratt would not sexually

assault children and/or that Bratt would not injure children.

19. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed Plaintiff a

duty of reasonable care because it had superior knowledge about the risk that Bratt posed to

Plaintiff, the risk of abuse in general in its schools and/or the risks that its facilities posed to

minor children.

20. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed a duty to

Plaintiff to protect Plaintiff from harm because Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free

School District's actions created a foreseeable risk of harm to Plaintiff. As a vulnerable child

attending Maryvale East Elementary School, Plaintiff was a foreseeable victim. As a vulnerable

child who Bratt had access to through Bratt's employment with Defendant Cheektowaga-

Maryvale Union Free School District, Plaintiff was a foreseeable victim.

21. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District also breached its

duty to Plaintiff by actively maintaining and employing Bratt in a position of power and

authority through which Bratt had access to children, including Plaintiff, and power and control

over children, including Plaintiff.

Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District breached its duties 22.

to Plaintiff. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District failed to use ordinary

care in determining whether its facilities were safe and/or determining whether it had sufficient

information to represent its facilities as safe. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

School District's breach of its duties include, but are not limited to: failure to protect Plaintiff from a known or reasonably foreseeable danger, failure to have sufficient policies and procedures to prevent child sex abuse, failure to properly implement policies and procedures to prevent child sex abuse, failure to take reasonable measures to make sure that policies and procedures to prevent child sex abuse were working, failure to adequately inform families and children of the risks of child sex abuse, failure to investigate risks of child sex abuse, failure to have any outside agency test its safety procedures, failure to protect the children attending its programs from child sex abuse, failure to adhere to the applicable standard of care for child safety, failure to investigate the amount and type of information necessary to represent the school

23. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District also breached its duty to Plaintiff by failing to warn Plaintiff and Plaintiff's family of the risk that Bratt posed. Defendant further failed to warn Plaintiff or Plaintiff's family of Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District's knowledge of the occurrence of child sexual abuse.

and its employees as safe, failure to train its employees properly to identify signs of child sexual

abuse by fellow employees, and to engage or timely engage certified health professionals

- 24. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District additionally violated its legal duty by failing to report known and/or suspected abuse of children by Bratt and/or its other agents to the police and law enforcement.
- 25. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District was negligent and/or made representations to Plaintiff and Plaintiff's family during each and every year of Plaintiff's attendance during Plaintiff's minority.
- 26. As a direct result of Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District's negligence as described herein, Plaintiff has suffered, and will continue to suffer, great

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

pain of mind and body, severe and permanent emotional distress, physical manifestations of

emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, humiliation and other physical, personal

and psychological injuries. Plaintiff was prevented, and will continue to be prevented, from

performing normal daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life; and/or has incurred

and will continue to incur expenses for psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling, and,

upon information and belief, has and/or will incur loss of income and/or loss of earning capacity.

AS AND FOR A FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION: NEGLIGENCE

27. Plaintiff incorporates all consistent paragraphs of this Complaint as if fully set

forth under this count.

28. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed Plaintiff a

duty of reasonable care to protect the Plaintiff from injury.

29. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed Plaintiff a

duty of reasonable care because Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District

had a special relationship with Plaintiff.

30. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District also had a duty

arising from its special relationship with Plaintiff, Plaintiff's parents, and other parents of young,

vulnerable children, to properly train and supervise its employees. The special relationship arose

because of the high degree of vulnerability of the children entrusted to Defendant Cheektowaga-

Maryvale Union Free School District's care. As a result of the high degree of vulnerability and

risk of sexual abuse inherent in such a special relationship, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale

Union Free School District had a duty to establish measures of protection not necessary for

persons who are older or better able to safeguard themselves.

6

8 of 14

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

31. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed Plaintiff a duty to protect Plaintiff from harm because Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District had a special relationship with Bratt.

- 32. By representing Bratt out as safe to work with children, and by undertaking the custody, supervision of, and/or care of the minor Plaintiff, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District entered into a fiduciary relationship with the minor Plaintiff. As a result of Plaintiff being a minor, and by Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District's undertaking of the care and guidance of then vulnerable minor Plaintiff, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District held a position of empowerment over Plaintiff.
- 33. Further, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District, by holding itself out as being able to provide a safe environment for children, accepted this position of empowerment. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District thus entered into a fiduciary relationship with Plaintiff. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District exploited its position of empowerment, putting Plaintiff at risk to be sexually assaulted.
- 34. By accepting custody of the minor Plaintiff, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District established an in loco parentis relationship with Plaintiff and in so doing, owed Plaintiff a duty to protect Plaintiff from injury.
- 35. By establishing, operating and/or administrating Maryvale East Elementary School, accepting the minor Plaintiff as a participant in its programs, holding its facilities and programs out to be a safe environment for Plaintiff, accepting custody of the minor Plaintiff in loco parentis, and by establishing a fiduciary relationship with Plaintiff, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District entered into an express and/or implied duty

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

to properly supervise Plaintiff and provide a reasonably safe environment for children attending

its schools. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District also owed Plaintiff a

duty to properly supervise Plaintiff to prevent harm from foreseeable dangers. Defendant

Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District had the duty to exercise the same degree of

care over minor students under its control as a reasonably prudent parent would have exercised

under similar circumstances.

36. By establishing and operating Maryvale East Elementary School and by accepting

the enrollment and participation of the minor Plaintiff as a participant in its educational

programs, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed Plaintiff a duty

to properly supervise Plaintiff to prevent harm from generally foreseeable dangers.

37. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District owed Plaintiff a

duty to protect Plaintiff from harm because Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free

School District was aware of Plaintiff's presence on its property and aware that Bratt posed a

dangerous condition on Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District's

property.

38. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District breached its duties

to Plaintiff by failing to use reasonable care. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free

School District's failures include, but are not limited to, failing to properly supervise Bratt,

failing to properly supervise Plaintiff and failing to protect Plaintiff from a known danger.

39. As a direct result of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical, emotional, and

psychological injuries, along with pain and suffering.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

AS AND FOR A SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION:
NEGLIGENT HIRING

40. Plaintiff incorporates all consistent paragraphs of this Complaint as if fully set

forth under this court.

41. At all times material, Bratt was employed by Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale

Union Free School District and was under Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School

District's direct supervision, employ and control when he/she committed the wrongful acts

alleged herein. Bratt engaged in the illegal conduct while acting in the course and scope of his

employment with Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District and/or

accomplished the sexual abuse by virtue of his/her job-created authority.

42. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District negligently hired

and/or negligently placed Bratt in a position to cause foreseeable harm which Plaintiff would not

have been subjected to had Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District taken

reasonable care in its pre-hiring investigation of Bratt.

43. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District knew or should

have known of Bratt's propensity for the type of behavior which resulted in Plaintiff's injuries.

44. As a result of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical, emotional and

psychological injuries, along with pain and suffering.

AS AND FOR A THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION: NEGLIGENT TRAINING AND SUPERVISION

45. Plaintiff incorporates all consistent paragraphs of this Complaint as if fully set

forth under this count.

46. At all times material, Bratt was employed by Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale

Union Free School District and was under Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

District's direct supervision, employ, and control when he committed the wrongful acts alleged

herein. Bratt engaged in the wrongful conduct while acting in the course and scope of his

employment with Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District and/or

accomplished the sexual abuse by virtue of his job-created authority.

47. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District had a duty, arising

from its employment of Bratt, to ensure that Bratt did not sexually molest children.

48. Further, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District had a duty

to train and educate employees and administrators and establish adequate and effective policies

and procedures calculated to detect, prevent, and address inappropriate behavior and conduct

between its employees and children.

49. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District was negligent in

the training, supervision, and instruction of its employees. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale

Union Free School District failed to timely and properly educate, train, supervise, and/or monitor

its agents or employees with regard to policies and procedures that should be followed when

sexual abuse of a child is suspected or observed.

50. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District was additionally

negligent in failing to supervise, monitor, chaperone, and/or investigate Bratt and/or in failing to

create, institute, and/or enforce rules, policies, procedures, and/or regulations to prevent Bratt's

sexual abuse of Plaintiff.

51. In failing to properly supervise Bratt, and in failing to establish such training

procedures for employees and administrators, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free

School District failed to exercise the care that a reasonably prudent parent would have exercised

under similar circumstances.

ERIE COUNTY CLERK 09/27/2019 09:53

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

As a direct result of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical, emotional, and 52. psychological injuries, along with pain and suffering.

AS AND FOR A FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION: NEGLIGENT RETENTION

- 53. Plaintiff incorporates all consistent paragraphs of this Complaint as if fully set forth under this count.
- 54. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District became aware or should have become aware of Bratt's propensity for child sexual abuse, and failed to take any further action to remedy the problem and failed to investigate or remove Bratt from working with children.
- 55. Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District negligently and/or recklessly retained Bratt with knowledge of Bratt's propensity for the type of behavior which resulted in Plaintiff's injuries in this action.
- 56. Defendant negligently and/or recklessly retained Bratt in a position where he had access to children and could foreseeably cause harm which Plaintiff would not have been subjected to had Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District acted reasonably.
- 57. In failing to timely remove Bratt from working with children or terminate the employment of Bratt, Defendant Cheektowaga-Maryvale Union Free School District negligently and/or recklessly failed to exercise the degree of care that a reasonably prudent parent would have exercised under similar circumstances.
- 58. As a direct result of the foregoing, Plaintiff sustained physical, emotional, and psychological injuries, along with pain and suffering.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 812616/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/27/2019

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, based on the foregoing causes of action, Plaintiff prays for judgment against Defendant(s) in an amount that will fully and fairly compensate Plaintiff for Plaintiff's injuries and damages, and for any other relief the Court deems appropriate. The amount of damages sought in this Complaint exceeds the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

J

DATED: September 27, 2019

Leah Costanzo, Esq.

STEVE BOYD, PC

40 North Forest Road
Williamsville, NY 14221
Telephone: (716) 400-0000
lcostanzo@steveboyd.com

Jeffrey R. Anderson
J. Michael Reck
JEFF ANDERSON & ASSOCIATES, P.A.
52 Duane Street, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10007
Telephone: (646) 759-2551
jeff@andersonadvocates.com
mreck@andersonadvocates.com
Counsel for Plaintiff